A REAPPRAISAL OF *PORPHYRA* AND *BANGIA* (BANGIOPHYCIDAE, RHODOPHYTA) IN THE NORTHEAST ATLANTIC BASED ON THE *rbc*L–*rbc*S INTERGENIC SPACER¹

Juliet Brodie²

Faculty of Applied Sciences, Bath Spa University College, Newton Park, Newton St. Loe, Bath BA2 9BN, United Kingdom

Paul K. Hayes, Gary L. Barker

School of Biological Sciences, University of Bristol, Woodland Road, Bristol BS8 1UG, United Kingdom

Linda M. Irvine

Botany Department, The Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, London SW7 5BD, United Kingdom

and

Inka Bartsch

Biologische Anstalt Helgoland, Zentrale Hamburg, Notkestrasse 31, D22607 Hamburg, Germany

ABSTRACT

Sequence data of the rbcL-rbcS noncoding intergenic spacer of the plastid genome for 47 specimens of Porphyra and Bangia from the northeast Atlantic reveal that they fall into 11 distinct sequences: P. purpurea, P. dioica (includes a sample of P. "ochotensis" from Helgoland), P. amplissima (includes P. thulaea and British records of P. "miniata"), P. linearis, P. umbilicalis, P. "miniata", B. atropurpurea s.l. from Denmark and B. atropurpurea s.l. from Wales, P. drachii, P. leucosticta (includes a British record of P. "miniata var. abyssicola"), and P. "insolita" (includes P. "yezoensis" from Hel-goland). Of these, data obtained for P. purpurea, P. dioica, P. amplissima, P. linearis, P. umbilicalis, P. drachii, and P. leucosticta were based on type specimens or material compared with types. Comparison of sequence data for Porphyra spp. and Bangia atropurpurea s.l. (including B. fuscopurpurea, the type species of Bangia) confirms that the species are congeneric. The data also confirm that the number of layers that make up the Porphyra thallus are not taxonomically significant. Comparison of sequence data for species from the northeast Atlantic with those for material of two species from the Pacific reveals that the species fall into two distinct groupings: an Atlantic group, containing P. purpurea, P. dioica, P. amplissima, P. linearis, P. umbilicalis, P. "miniata", and B. atropurpurea, and a Pacific group, containing P. "pseudolinearis", P. drachii, P. leucosticta, P. "yezoensis" (including a sample of P. "tenera"), and P. "insolita" (including P. "yezoensis" from Helgoland). The possibility of alien species in the northeast Atlantic is discussed.

Key index words: Atlantic; Bangia; introduced species; Pacific; Porphyra; Rhodophyta; RUBISCO spacer; taxonomy

Abbreviation: s.l., sensu lato

The red algal family Bangiaceae currently has two genera assigned to it, *Porphyra* and *Bangia*, but in this paper we now have good evidence that the type species are congeneric. Species of *Porphyra* occur in the intertidal and shallow subtidal zones in cool- to warm-temperate regions of the world and at certain times of the year can be the dominant algae in some shore regions. Some species are economically important, being harvested from the wild or grown commercially as food; for example, laver and nori. *Bangia* occurs mainly in the intertidal zone in cool to tropical regions.

Despite being the subject of much study over at least the last 100 years, the taxonomy within the family remains problematic, mainly because of the highly variable morphology and lack of easily recognizable characters. Molecular techniques have been used to assist in the discrimination of species of Porphyra (Lindstrom and Cole 1992a, b, Stiller and Waaland 1993, 1996, Oliveira et al. 1995), and an analysis of nucleotide sequence data of the plastidborne rbcL-rbcS intergenic spacer (RUBISCO spacer) has proved useful in differentiating between two often confused species of Porphyra (Brodie et al. 1996): Porphyra dioica Brodie et L. Irvine (as P. laciniata) was distinguished from P. purpurea using this technique, and sound morphological characters confirmed it as a distinct species (Brodie and Irvine 1997). In this paper, species-level taxonomy based on analysis of the RUBISCO spacer data is explored for specimens of Porphyra and Bangia from the northeast Atlantic. We also compare sequence data for three Pacific samples of Porphyra.

Six species of *Porphyra*, as well as *Bangia atropurpurea*, were recognized for the coasts of Britain, Ireland, and adjacent waters by Parke and Dixon (1976). A further five species were reported for the northeast Atlantic by South and Tittley (1986) and five more by Guiry (1997) (Table 1). We have tested specimens purporting to belong to all these species except for *P. helenae*; although we have been able to

¹ Received 21 October 1997. Accepted 1 September 1998.

² Corresponding author; e-mail j.brodie@bathspa.ac.uk

Parke and Dixon (1976)	South and Tittley (1986)	Guiry (1997)	This study
Bangia atropurpurea (Roth) C. Agardh	B. atropurpurea	B. atropurpurea	B. atropurpurea
	P. abyssicola Kjellman		nd
	P. abyssicola Kjellman		nd
P. amethystea Kützing	P. amethystea	P. amethystea	nd
	P. amplissima (Kjellman) Setchell et Hus	-	P. amplissima
	P. drachii J. Feldmann	P. drachii	P. drachii
	P. helenaea A. Zinova		nd
		P. insolita Kornmann & Sahling	P. ''insolita''
		P. laciniata (Lightfoot) C. Agardh	P. dioica Brodie & L. Irvine
P. leucosticta Thuret in Le Jolis	P. leucosticta	P. leucosticta	P. leucosticta
P. linearis Greville	P. linearis	P. linearis	P. linearis
P. miniata (C. Agardh) C. Agardh	P. miniata	P. miniata	P. amplissima (most samples)
		P. ochotensis Nagai ^a	P. dioica ^a
P. purpurea (Roth) C. Agardh	P. purpurea	P. purpurea	P. purpurea
	* *	P. purpureo-violacea	P. purpurea ^b
		(Roth) Krishnamurthy	
	P. thulaea Munda & Pedersen	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	P. amplissima
P. umbilicalis (Linnaeus) J. Agardh	P. umbilicalis	P. umbilicalis	P. umbilicalis
. ,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,		P. yezoensis Ueda	P. ''insolita''

TABLE 1. Species of Porphyra and Bangia listed for Great Britain, Ireland, and the North Atlantic. nd = not determined.

^a Abstract includes P. "ochotensis" in P. dioica; see also Results and Discussion.

^b See Brodie and Irvine (1997).

extract DNA, we have not been able to obtain a RUBISCO spacer sequence for type material of *P. amethystea*, and we have no sequences for verified *P. abyssicola* or *P. miniata*.

A major problem exists in relating our data to those published elsewhere, as specimens given the same names are not necessarily conspecific. Thus, whenever possible, our sequence data are based only on types or authentic or similar material; nonauthenticated names are given in quotation marks (Table 1).

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Material. Specimens used for molecular analysis were from Great Britain, Germany (Helgoland), Ireland, Norway, Faroes, Denmark, Greenland, and Japan (Table 2). DNA was extracted from one of the following: freshly collected material, herbarium specimens, silica gel- preserved plants, *Conchocelis*, or blade-phase cultures. *Conchocelis* cultures were initiated from zygotospores (sensu Guiry 1990) released from fertile sections of the blade phase as described by Brodie et al. (1996). Blades developed in culture either directly (*P. umbilicalis* from Brighton) or from spores released by the *Conchocelis*-phase. Cultures were grown in nutrient-enriched seawater as described by Brodie and Guiry (1988) and incubated at 15° C, 16:8 h LD cycle, incident irradiance of 20 µmol photons·m⁻²·s⁻¹. Some *Conchocelis* cultures arrived by post, having been initiated elsewhere.

DNA extraction and PCR amplification. Procedures for DNA extraction and PCR amplification were as described by Brodie et al. (1996). Primers used were complementary to the 3' end of *rbd*. (5'TGTGGACCTCTACAAACAGC3') and the 5' end of *rbc*S (5'CCCCTAGTTCCCAAT3') (Maggs et al. 1992).

Sequencing and analysis. Manual sequencing was carried out according to the method described by Brodie et al. (1996). Automated sequencing was performed commercially on an ABI prism 377 sequencer. Sequences were visually aligned, and a Jukes-Cantor-corrected distance matrix was calculated using DNADIST in the PHYLIP package (Felsenstein 1989).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

PCR amplification of the *rbcL-rbcS* spacer and flanking coding regions for *Porphyra* species and *Bangia atropurpurea* yielded a product of about 320 bp for all isolates. A common region including the 3' end of *rbcL*, the 77-bp spacer, and the rbcS start codon was sequenced for all isolates (Fig. 1); from a total of 50 specimens, we found 13 distinct sequences represented by (with EMBL accession number): *P. purpurea* (AJ010776), *P. dioica* (includes *P. "ochotensis"*) (AJ010779), *P. amplissima* (includes *P. thulaea*) (AJ010780), *P. linearis* (AJ010781), *P. umbilicalis* (AJ010782), *P. "miniata"* (AJ010786), *B. atropurpurea s.l.* from Denmark (AJ010784), *B. atropurpurea s.l.* from Wales (AJ010785), *P. "pseudolinearis"* (AJ010787), *P. drachii* (AJ010788), *P. leucosticta* (AJ010789), *P. "yezoensis"* (AJ010783), and *P. "insolita"* (AJ010778) (Table 2).

These data have thus helped clarify the circumscriptions of the species of *Porphyra* in the northeast Atlantic. Samples of type specimens or material carefully compared with types (*P. purpurea, P. dioica, P. amplissima, P. linearis, P. thulaea, P. umbilicalis, P. drachii*, and *P. leucosticta*) can, with the exception of *P. thulaea*, be distinguished morphologically and have different *rbc*L–*rbc*S spacer sequences. The sequence for *P. amplissima* is the same as that for type material of *P. thulaea*.

No sequence variation was found within species, with the exception of one specimen of *P. purpurea* from Hayling Island. This sample differed from the other *P. purpurea* isolates by a single base transition, T to C, in the third position of an alanine codon seven base pairs before the stop codon of *rbc*L (Fig.

Specimens	Code	Location	Date	Collector	Material	Species according to nbdL-rbcS sequence
Northeast Atlantic						
P. purpurea	Phy	Seabrook, nr Hythe, Kent, England	9.viii.1956	K. Drew (Drew no. 2885 BM)	Η	$P. \ purpurea$
	P121	Lilstock, Somerset, England	28.ii.1994	J. Brodie (JB culture no. 121)	ű d	P. purpurea
	C1 07	Lilstock, Somerset, England Lilstock Somerest England	9.VI.1994 0	J. Brodie (on peddle in sand) T. Brodia (on boulder IB culture no 197)	n ć	P. purpurea
	F14/	Luistock, Sourerset, Euglatiu I angstone Harbour Havling Is Fingland	9.VI.1994 13 vii 1004	J. Brodie (on boulder, JB culture no. 127) I. Brodie (on boulder IB culture no. 161)	30	r. purpurea D humburea (Havling Is)
	Psm	Portaferry. N. Ireland	P.i.1995	D. Birkett	d D	P. burburea
	Pfe	Lyme Regis, Dorset, England	16.v.1995	I. Brodie	Sciences	P. purpurea
	JB28	Helgoland, Germany	23.viii.1995	J. Brodie	o N	P. purpurea
P. dioica	063	Helgoland, Germany	26.ii.1991	I. Bartsch (Bartsch culture no. 063)	ö	P. dioica
	P156	Sidmouth, Devon, England	3.xi.1994	J. Brodie (JB culture no. 156)	ŭ ŭ	P. dioica
	163	Cruden Bay, Aberdeenshire, Scotland Cruden Bay, Aberdeenshire, Scotland	201.1995 96:1005	L. Terry (JB culture no. 163) I Terry (JB culture no. 167)	36	P. dioica D. dioica
	107 IB48	Sidmonth. Devon. England	9.ix.1995	L. Brodie (amonest <i>Enteromorbia</i>)	2 %	P. dinica
P. amplissima	Pstr	Strangford Lough, N. Ireland	1.iv.1995	C. A. Maggs (subtidal, epiphytic)	0 60 N	P. amplissima
٩	Pmvi	Vatlestraumen, Norway	11.vi.1996	J. Rueness	80 80	P. amplissima
	$\mathbf{JB89}$	Dale, Pembrokeshire, Wales	16.vi.1996	J. Brodie (drift on mudflats)	so So	P. amplissima
D limentic	JB91 D050	Ulyde Estuary, Scotland	2.vii.1996 95 :: 1001	J. Hall-Spencer (subtidal) I. Bortsch (herhorium rof. DI:9/19)	so c	P. amplussima D. limitarie
r. uneuns	P052	Helgoland, Germany Helgoland, Germany	25.11.1991	I. Bartsch (herbarium ref. Phi1/13) I. Bartsch (herbarium ref. Phi1/13)	30	F. tinearis P. linearis
	Plinh	Havling Island, England	28.ii.1995	W. F. Farnham	Se	P. linearis
	125	South Beach, Aberystwyth, Wales	10.iv.1994	I. Plumb	ဗပိ	P. linearis
P. umbilicalis	P143	The Smalls, Pembrokeshire, Wales	30.viii.1994	S. Scott (on lighthouse wood)	Cb	P. umbilicalis
	Pum	Margate, Kent, England	?.viii.1995	I. Tittley	D	P. umbilicalis
	P126	Brighton, Sussex, England	16.iv.1994	J. Brodie (near working pier)	9 9	P. umbilicalis
	2108	Helgoland, Germany	No date	K. Lüning	ű,	P. umbilicalis
	P170	Cook Street Pier, N. Ireland	8.ii.1995	D. Birkett	n a	P. umblicalis
	C-IN	velbastadur, Sureymoy, Faroes	2.V.1990	K. Gunnarsson & K. Nielson /herheitum rof. E061359-10	50	F. umonicaus
				(nerbarium ret. F301332 ru, 3 individuals)		
P. "miniata",	Psam	Lirberg, Sandoy, Faroes	28.v.1997	K. Gunnarsson	D	P. '' miniata''
Bangia atropurpurea	129	Lœsø, Denmark	25.v.1994	R. Nielsen	U	B. atropurpurea
7 7 D	JB72	Rhosneigr, Anglesey	14.iv.1995	E. Jones & J. Brodie	Sg	B. atropurpurea
P. drachii	Pdr	The Smalls, Pembrokeshire, Wales	30.viii.1994	F. Bunker (subtidal, on kelp frond)	H	P. drachii
P. leucosticta	Pleuc	Flamborough Head, Yorkshire, England	23.viii.1994	J. Brodie	Ũ	P. leucosticta
	P. gu	Guernsey, Channel Islands	6.vi.1995	G. Barker	20 20	P. leucosticta
	P. sp.	Sherkin Island, Co. Cork, Ireland	7.V.1995	H. Fazakerley T. B 45	ה ר	P. leucosticta
		I law Doning to Molog	10.VL.1990	J. DI OUIE E Minumary (ambridal in Italia famaat)	00 č 0 č	F. veucosucia D Immostiata
P "in solito",	050	Helooland Germany	No date	E. Muttay (subudat, 111 Kelp 101 est) I Rartech	n S C	r. teucostacia P umbilicalis
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	061	Helgoland, Germany	26.ii.1991	I. Bartsch	, c	P. '' insolita''
P. sp.	Pmu	Muckinish. Co. Clare. Ireland	25.xi.1996	H. Fazakerlev	D	P. ''insolita''
P. "vezoensis"	055	Helgoland, Germany	26.ii.1991	P. Kornmann (as P. vezoensis)	ප්	P. ''insolita''
"P. miniata var.	Pab	Ore Bay, Orkney, Scotland	8.ix.1926	L. Lyle	Η	P. leucosticta
abyssicola" D "cchotonsis"	TR1 TR9	Heleoland Cermany	101 101	I Bartech (3 individuale)		D divica
1 . 0010001313	990	rregoratu, octinizity	TCCT WINT	1. Dat bell (9 muviquals)	۲ ۲	1. 000000
P. thulaea	Pth	Godthaab, Greenland	28.viii.1958	T. Christensen 8464	Н	P. amplissima
				(Flora of Greenland, BM isotype)		
Pacific						
P. ''yezoensis''	Pye	Oshoro Bay, Japan	17.v.1996	M. Masuda	Ηú	P. "yezoensis"
P. ''tenera' P. ''tseudolinearis''	Pte P2	Fukuyama, Japan Hokkaido. Tanan	1968 2.i.1995	1. Fujiyama K. Koyame (Bartsch culture no. 074)	a č	P. ''yezoensıs' P. ''tseudolinearis''
	F t				,	

Specimens used for molecular analysis. C = culture, Cc = culture, Conchocelis phase, Cb = culture, blade phase, D = dried blade, H = herbarium specimen, Sg = blade dried in silica gel, Natural History Museum London. TABLE 2. BM = The 1071

	1				99
P. purpurea	CCAACAGCCAACGTCTAGTTCAAT	GACTACTTACAACTGC-TTAA	ACTAGCAAAGTATAAGTA	SAATTAACTTATAAAAATAA	GGAGCATAGAATAGTG
P. purpurea H	T				
P. dioica	T				
P. amplissima	A	.			C
P. línearís	A	TT	G		
P. umbilicalís	AA	T -	G		
B. atr D		.		A	C.A
B. atr W				4	C.A
P. 'miniata'				C	C
P. 'pseudolinearis'			.TC	c	
P. drachii		G.T.AG	TT	C	
P. leucosticta			TCTCGG		
P. 'vezoensis'			G	c	
P. 'insolita'	AA		GTCT.GG		

FIG. 1. Sequence alignment of *Porphyra* and *Bangia* species rbcL-rbcS regions. Underlined: stop codon rbcL and start codon rbcS; . = same base; - = space; H = Hayling Island, D = Denmark, W = Wales.

1). In the absence of any discernible morphological differences between *P. purpurea* from Hayling Island and other *P. purpurea* isolates, we feel that the single transition in the *rbc*L region does not, in this case, warrant separation of *P. purpurea* into two species.

Specimens provisionally identified as *Porphyra* "*miniata*" are clearly distinguishable morphologically (Brodie and Irvine, pers. observ.) and molecularly from the other species of *Porphyra* in this region, but type material has not been available for comparison. The records of *P. miniata* in Great Britain appear to be based on misidentifications of *P. amplissima*.

Porphyra drachii was first described by Feldmann (1979) on the basis of specimens collected from the fronds of *Laminaria hyperborea* off the coast of Brittany by Pierre Drach in 1948. The first published record of this species in Great Britain was in 1997 (Table 1). Searches so far failed to locate the type material, but a comparison of our specimens with plants collected by J. Cabioch from Santec, Brittany, France, and considered by her to be genuine *P. drachii* (proposed Neotype; Cabioch, pers. comm.) appear to confirm that they are conspecific.

Porphyra amethystea remains a mystery, as we have not been able to obtain a sequence from type material. *Porphyra abyssicola* and *P. helenaea* also require further study.

The one base-pair difference in the *rbc*L-*rbc*S spacer between B. atropurpurea from Denmark and Wales suggests that there might be more than one species in the northern Atlantic. Nevertheless, our data confirm that *B. atropurpurea s. l.* (Danish and Welsh) and Porphyra spp. are congeneric, as suggested by Oliveira et al. (1995), whose ssu-rDNA data showed that it nested stably within the *Porphyra* group. The type species of the genus Bangia Lyngbye (1819:82) is B. fuscopurpurea, based on marine material collected from limestone rocks at Dunraven Castle near Bridgend, south Wales, by W.W. Young and described by Dillwyn (1807: table 92) as Conferva fuscopurpurea. The type has not been located, and visits to the type locality over the past two years have failed to find any Bangia at the site. Before making a formal transfer, we need to obtain morphological and sequence data from material that can be designated as a neotype of *B. fuscopurpurea*, on which a nomenclatural change could be based. We have made no observations on freshwater material and so cannot speculate on the affinity of *B. atropurpurea* (Roth) C. Agardh (1824:76), of which *B. fuscopurpurea* is usually regarded as a synonym.

The data have also helped to resolve the debate about the taxonomic significance of the number of cell layers that make up the *Porphyra* blade (Brodie et al. 1997). Species have sometimes been distinguished on the basis of whether the blades are mono- or distromatic. Isolates of *P. amplissima* used in this study consisted of either monostromatic (Pstr, Table 1) or distromatic (JB89, JB91, Pmi, Table 2) blades. Sometimes both one and two cell layers can be observed within a single, vegetative thallus (Brodie, pers. observ.). This is also in accord with the observations of Stiller and Waaland (1993) and Oliveira et al. (1995), who found no correlation between phylogenetic position and the number of cell layers.

The distance matrix (Table 3) shows that the species fall into two distinct groupings: an Atlantic group (mean distance = 0.04644, SD 0.01937, n = 36) containing *P. purpurea*, *P. dioica*, *P. amplissima*, *P. linearis*, *P. umbilicalis*, *P. "miniata"*, and *B. atropurpurea* (Denmark and Wales) (Table 2), and a Pacific group (mean distance = 0.05720, SD 0.03011, n = 10), which includes *P. "insolita" from Helgoland*, *P. leucosticta* and *P. drachii* from Great Britain, and *P. "pseudolinearis"* and *P. "yezoensis"* from Japan. The mean distance between the two groups is 0.14089, SD 0.01855, n = 45.

Porphyra leucosticta is widespread in Great Britain and Ireland and is also reported from other northern European and Mediterranean countries, but its alignment with the Pacific group raises the question of its origin. One possibility is that it is an alien species in the North Atlantic. If this is the case, its presence around much of the coast suggests that it is well established; it must have arrived at least 135 years ago, as there are herbarium records dating back to 1863. It was first described by Thuret in Le Jolis in 1863, and we have found no British specimens collected earlier than this subsequently identified as *P. leucosticta*. It was reported from Denmark (Rosenvinge 1909), Helgoland (Herbarium Kuck-

TABLE 3. Distance matrix of Porphyra and Bangia species based on rbcL-rbcS sequence data. The italic area indicates the Atlantic group; the bold area indicates the Pacific group. The specific name is represented by the first three letters; H = Hayling Island, D = Denmark, and W = Wales.

	P. pur	P. purH	P. dio	P. amp	P. lin	P. umb	P. ''min''	B. atrD	B. atrW	P. "pse"	P. dra	P. leu	P. yez	P. "ins"
P. pur	0.0000	0.0103	0.0103	0.0313	0.0528	0.0528	0.0528	0.0639	0.0751	0.1216	0.1337	0.1476	0.1476	0.1476
P. pur H		0.0000	0.0207	0.0313	0.0528	0.0528	0.0528	0.0639	0.0751	0.1216	0.1337	0.1476	0.1476	0.1476
P. dio			0.0000	0.0207	0.0420	0.0420	0.0420	0.0528	0.0639	0.1097	0.1216	0.1352	0.1352	0.1352
P. amp				0.0000	0.0420	0.0420	0.0207	0.0313	0.0420	0.1097	0.1216	0.1352	0.1352	0.1352
P. lin					0.0000	0.0207	0.0639	0.0639	0.0751	0.1337	0.1460	0.1476	0.1476	0.1476
P. umb						0.0000	0.0639	0.0639	0.0751	0.1337	0.1460	0.1476	0.1476	0.1476
P. ''min''							0.0000	0.0528	0.0103	0.0980	0.1097	0.1230	0.1230	0.1230
B. atr D								0.0000	0.0420	0.1460	0.1585	0.1732	0.1732	0.1732
B. atr W									0.0000	0.1460	0.1585	0.1732	0.1230	0.1732
P. " <i>pse</i> "										0.0000	0.0313	0.0759	0.0759	0.0646
P. dra											0.0000	0.0874	0.0874	0.0874
P. leu												0.0000	0.0207	0.0207
P. vez													0.0000	0.0207
P. ''ins''														0.0000

uck 1897-at BAH Helgoland), Cherbourg, northern France (Thuret in Le Jolis 1863), and Sweden (Kylin 1907). Furthermore, published (but unconfirmed) records suggest that it is widespread on both sides of the Atlantic, in the east from Iceland and Norway to Spain and the Azores, the Mediterranean, and the Black Sea (Athanasiadis 1987), and in the west from Canada (Labrador) to the United States (New Hampshire) (South and Tittley 1986). Whether all reports of P. leucosticta belong to a single species remains to be resolved. Kornmann (1961) speculated that it might be the same species as *P. tenera* from the north Pacific, as there are great similarities in morphology and life history of both species. Another possibility is that an ancestor originating in the Pacific crossed the Bering Straits and Canadian Arctic archipelago to the Atlantic Ocean during a period of raised palaeoclimate temperatures (Van den Hoek 1982). Further examination of specimens from the Arctic and Mediterranean would provide valuable data here. The alignment of P. drachii with the Pacific group suggests that it also could be an alien.

The concept of the occurrence of alien species among the east Atlantic representatives of the genus is not new. Kornmann (1986) reported the presence of a species in Helgoland that he identified as P. yezoensis Ueda, following Kurogi (1959, 1961, 1972), and concluded that it was an immigrant from the Pacific (East Asia). Similarly, Kornmann and Sahling (1991) provisionally identified a species first observed in 1959 on Helgoland as another East Asian species, P. "ochotensis", because of similarities in carpospore arrangement (Kurogi 1972). Specimens identified as P. "ochotensis" from Helgoland (Table 2) have the same RUBISCO spacer sequence as P. *dioica*, but whether the Helgoland and the Pacific plants are conspecific is not yet clear. The discovery in 1988 of a third unidentified species of Porphyra on Helgoland initially led Kornmann and Sahling (1991) to speculate that this was another Pacific (East Asian) immigrant, but their failure to identify it with any species from that region caused them to

describe it as a new species, *P. insolita*, which they suggested had hitherto gone unrecognized on other European coasts. Material in culture identified by Kornmann as *P. "yezoensis"* from Helgoland does not have the same RUBISCO spacer sequence as our sample of *P. "yezoensis"* from Japan (although closely related) but has the same sequence as *P. "insolita"* 061 from Helgoland (leg. Bartsch) (Table 2). Kornmann and Sahling's initial speculation that *P. "insolita"* is an introduction from the Pacific would appear to be reasonable, although its identity remains uncertain. The type of *P. insolita* cannot be found.

Other evidence of a link between Pacific and Atlantic species of *Porphyra* has been proposed by Lindstrom and Cole (1992b, 1993), who found a number of closely related "species pairs" in these two geographical regions. Stiller and Waaland (1996), using RFLPs, found that P. rediviva Stiller and Waaland was most closely related to P. purpurea, although the two species differed in chromosome number, season of first appearance, and habitat. Stiller and Waaland (1996) argued that their data suggested prolonged genetic separation between these species. Their material of P. purpurea included samples supplied by C. Bird (one of which was European material from Hayling Island, United Kingdom); she had previously established, by molecular analysis, that her east Canadian specimens were conspecific with British Isles P. purpurea (Bird, unpubl.). Unfortunately, we do not always know whether specimens passing under the same name as those we have examined are in fact conspecific.

Of the other species in the Pacific group in Table 2, the material identified as *P. "tenera"* has the same sequence as *P. "yezoensis"* and possibly is a misidentification; sequence data from an authentic sample of *P. tenera* would confirm this. The sample of "*P. tenera"* came from a sheet of compressed nori (Hoshi-nori) dated 1968; these sheets are now usually prepared from dried *P. yezoensis* (Miura 1975). In 1955, cultivators began transplanting *P. yezoensis* from its natural habitats, and it has replaced *P. tenera* in many areas of Japan.

The relationship between the northeast and northwest Atlantic species requires resolution. *Porphyra amplissima, B. atropurpurea, P. leucosticta, P. linearis, P. miniata, P. purpurea* and *P. umbilicalis* are listed for the northwest Atlantic (South and Tittley 1986, Bird and McLachlan 1992), but conspecificity with their northeast Atlantic counterparts is for the most part not yet determined.

Whether the RUBISCO spacer is a useful tool with which to assess species-level taxonomy probably depends on the genus involved, the time scale of separation of species, and the level of resolution required. The antiquity of *Porphyra* and *Bangia* (Xiao et al. 1998) and the data presented above indicate that analysis of the RUBISCO spacer region is the method of choice for the preliminary screening of these genera, and their spacer has proved a valuable indicator for discriminating between species of *Porphyra* which have been notoriously difficult to identify. As the differences between sequences are relatively few, greater resolution within the Bangiophycidae might be obtained using other regions of the genome.

We are extremely grateful to all the people mentioned in Table 2 who have very kindly sent material. We also thank Marion Rayner for maintenance of cultures and H. Brodie for maintenance of J.B.'s herbarium. We acknowledge the support of NERC grant GR9/02594.

- Agardh, C. A. 1824. Systema algarum. Lund, Gleerups, [i]-xxxviii, [1]-312.
- Athanasiadis A. 1987. A survey of the seaweeds of the Aegean Sea with taxonomic studies on species of the Tribe Antithannieae (Rhodophyta). University of Gothenburg, Faculty of Natural Sciences.
- Bird, C. J. & McLachlan, J. L. 1992. Seaweed Flora of the Maritimes. 1. Rhodophyta—the Red Algae. Biopress Ltd., England.
- Brodie, J. & Guiry, M. D. 1988. Life history and reproduction of *Botryocladia ardreana* sp. nov. (Rhodophyta, Rhodymeniales) from Portugal. *Phycologia* 27:109–30.
- Brodie, J., Hayes, P. K., Barker, G. L. & Irvine, L. M. 1996. Molecular and morphological characters distinguishing two *Porphyra* species (Rhodophyta: Bangiophycidae). *Eur. J. Phycol.* 31:303–8.
- Brodie, J., Hayes, P. K., Barker, G. L. & Irvine, L. M. 1997. Porphyra miniata: a question of layers. The Phycologist 46:13 (abstract).
- Brodie, J. & Irvine, L. M. 1997. A comparison of *Porphyra dioica* sp. nov. and *P. purpurea* (Roth) C. Ag. (Rhodophyta: Bangiophycidae) in Europe. *Crypt. Algol.* 18:283–96.
- Dillwyn, L. W. 1807. British Confervae fasc 13. London.
- Feldmann, J. 1979. Sur une nouvelle espèce de Porphyra (P. drachii J. Feldm.) et remarques sur l'évolution des plastes chez les Rhodophycées (Bangiophycidées et Acrochaetiales). Vie Milieu 28–29:425–35.
- Felsenstein, J. 1989. PHYLIP—Phylogeny inference Package (Version 3.2). *Cladistics* 5:164–6.
- Guiry, M. D. 1990. Spores and sporangia. In Cole, K.M. & Sheath, R.G. [Eds.] Biology of the Red Algae. Cambridge University Press, New York, pp. 347–76.
 - 1997. Benthic red, brown and green algae. In Howson, C.M. & Picton, B.E. [Eds.] The Species Directory of the Marine

Fauna and Flora of the British Isles and Surrounding Seas. Ulster Museum and The Marine Conservation Society, Belfast and Ross-on-Wye, pp. 341–67.

- Kornmann, P. 1961. Die Entwicklung von Porphyra leucosticta im Kulturversuch. Helgol. wiss. Meeres. 8:167–75.
- 1986. Porphyra yezoensis bei Helgoland—eine entwicklungsgeschichtliche Studie. Helgol. Meeresunters. 40:327–42.
- Kornmann, P. & Sahling, P.-H. 1991. The Porphyra species of Helgoland (Bangiales, Rhodophyta). Helgol. Meeresunters 45: 1–38.
- Kuckuck, P. 1897. Bemerkungen zur marinen Algenvegetation von Helgoland II. Wiss. Meeresunters. (Helgol.) N. F. 2:371–400.
- Kurogi, M. 1959. Porphyra yezoensis Ueda at Muroran. Bull. Tohoku reg. Fish. Res. Lab. 15:43–51.
- <u>—</u> 1961. Species of cultivated *Porphyras* and their life histories. *Bull. Tohoku reg. Fish. Res. Lab.* 18:1–115.
- 1972. Systematics of Porphyra in Japan. In Abbott, I. A. & Kurogi, M. [Eds.] Contributions to the Systematics of Benthic Marine Algae of the North Pacific. Japanese Society of Phycology, Kobe, Japan, pp. 167–92.
- Kylin, H. 1907. Studien über die Algenflora der Schwedischen Westküste. K. W. Appelbergs Buchdruckerei, Uppsala.
- Le Jolis, A. 1863. Liste des algues marines de Cherbourg. J. B. Bailliere et fils, Paris.
- Lindstrom, S. C. & Cole, K. M. 1992a. Relationships between some North Atlantic and North Pacific species of *Porphyra* (Bangiales, Rhodophyta): evidence from isozymes, morphology, and chromosomes. *Can. J. Bot.* 70:1355–63.
- 1992b. A revision of the species of *Porphyra* (Rhodophyta: Bangiales) occurring in British Columbia and adjacent waters. *Can. J. Bot.* 70:2066–75.
 1993. The systematics of *Porphyra*: character evolution in
- 1993. The systematics of *Porphyra*: character evolution in closely related species. *Hydrobiologia* 260/261:151–7.
- Lyngbye, H. C. 1819. Tentamen hydrophytologiae danicae. Copenhagen.
- Maggs, C. A., Douglas, S. E., Fenety, J. & Bird, C. J. 1992. A molecular and morphological analysis of the *Gymnogongrus devoniensis* (Rhodophyta) complex in the north Atlantic. J. *Phycol.* 28:214–32.
- Miura, A. 1975. Porphyra cultivation in Japan. In Tokida, J. & Hirose, H. [Eds.] Advances of Phycology in Japan. Gustav Fischer Verlag, Jena, pp. 273–304.Oliveira, M. C., Kurniawan, J., Bird, C. J., Rice, E. L., Murphy, C.
- Oliveira, M. C., Kurniawan, J., Bird, C. J., Rice, E. L., Murphy, C. A., Singh, R. K., Gutell, R. R. & Ragan, M. A. 1995. A preliminary investigation of the order Bangiales (Bangiophycidae, Rhodophyta) based on sequences of nuclear small-subunit ribosomal RNA genes. *Phycol. Res.* 43:71–9.
- Parke, M. & Dixon, P. S. 1976. Check-list of British marine algae—third revision. J. Mar. Biol. Assoc. UK 56:527–94. Rosenvinge, L. K. 1909. The Marine Algae of Denmark. Part I: In-
- Rosenvinge, L. K. 1909. The Marine Algae of Denmark. Part I: Introduction. Rhodophyceae I. D. Kgl. Danske Vidensk. Selsk. Skrifter, 7 Raekke, Naturvidensk Mathem. Afd. 7:1–151.
- South, G. R. & Tittley, I. 1986. A Checklist and Distributional Index of the British Marine Algae of the North Atlantic Ocean. Huntsman Marine Laboratory and British Museum (Natural History), St. Andrews/London.
- Stiller, J. W. & Waaland, J. R. 1993. Molecular analysis reveals cryptic diversity in *Porphyra* (Rhodophyta). J. Phycol. 29:506– 17.
- 1996. Porphyra rediviva sp. nov. (Rhodophyta): a new species from northeast Pacific salt marshes. J. Phycol. 32:323–32.
- Van den Hoek, C. 1982. Phytogeographic distribution groups of benthic marine algae in the North Atlantic Ocean. A review of experimental evidence from life history studies. *Helgol. Meeresunters*. 35:153–214.
- Xiao S., Zhang Y. & Knoll A. H. 1998. Three-dimensional preservation of algae and animal embryos in a Neoproterozohic phosphorite. *Nature* 391:553–8.